Instructional Practice in a Proficiency-Based System
How Formative Assessment Drives Student Learning

Reed Dyer, Senior Associate, GSP
Katie Thompson, Senior Associate, GSP
Outcomes

I understand why “Backwards Design” is fundamental to Proficiency Based Learning.

Where am I going?
I can design formative assessments that inform myself and my students about their progress towards learning outcomes.

Where am I now?
Outcomes

I can reflect on and adjust instruction based on formative assessment data/evidence.

How can I close the gap?
Outcomes

I can explain how specific classroom structures and lesson designs support equitable learning opportunities for all students.

*How can I close the gap?*
Outcomes

I can identify opportunities for intervention and re-teaching at the classroom level.

*How do I close the gap?*
Agenda

High Quality Instruction & Intervention: MTSS-RTI

Backwards Design and Formative Assessment

Research and Exemplars

Classroom Practices & Structures

Differentiation and Intervention
VERMONT Multi-tiered System of Supports
Response to Intervention and Instruction (MTSS-RtII) Field Guide

Vermont Reads Institute at UVM
and
Vermont Statewide Steering Committee on RTII
1. Equitable learning- demanding content standards, high expectations, and excellent instruction.

2. Teachers apply research-based practices skillfully, flexibly, and responsively.

3. Instruction and intervention at all tiers are guided by an articulated framework for curriculum, instruction, and assessment, aligned with CCSS.

4. Teachers use relevant assessment data to differentiate and provide instruction that is responsive to students’ diverse strengths and needs, so that all students meet standards.

5. Multi-tiered system begins with the highest-quality classroom instruction that is informed by research and supported by a standards-based curriculum.

6. When differentiated classroom instruction is not sufficient to meet students’ learning needs, we provide supplemental (additional) intervention that is tailored to their needs.

7. Students who require even more intensive or specialized instruction receive additional intervention services and supports; including, but not limited to, Special Education services.

8. Instruction and intervention are carefully orchestrated so that they provide a comprehensive, coherent, and tailored program of instruction for all students, within and across grade levels.
Intervention Systems

1) What are we currently doing that is aligned with this characteristic?

2) What shifts could we make to improve in this area?
Intervention Systems

Debrief at your table:

• What structures and practices do we have in place that promote high quality instruction and intervention?

• What might we need to think about moving forward?

• How could we use MTSS-RTI as a resource?
PBL Assessment is driven by the same questions for teachers and students

Where am I going?
PBL Assessment is driven by the same questions for teachers and students.

Where am I now?
PBL Assessment is driven by the same questions for teachers and students.

How can I close the gap between where I am now and where I want to go?
# Instruction & Assessment Roles

## Assessment + Instruction
In a Proficiency-Based System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Teacher’s Role</th>
<th>Student’s Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Where am I going? | - Give students clear statements of the performance indicators and learning targets  
                     - Unpack performance indicators and learning targets with students  
                     - Share exemplars of student work                                            | - Put learning targets and indicators in my own words  
                     - Create my own definitions of quality work (ideally using scoring criteria and exemplars)  
                     - Consider what I know and can do based on these targets and indicators |
| Where am I now?   | - Pre-assess student knowledge & skills  
                     - Give students specific, descriptive feedback                              | Reflect:  
                     - What are my strengths?  
                     - What do I need to work on?                                                |
| How do I close the gap? | - Help students self-assess and set goals  
                            - Limit feedback to the amount of advice a student can act upon  
                            - Deliver nonjudgmental feedback within an environment that celebrates mistakes as learning opportunities  
                            - Design learning opportunities to focus on one learning target or aspect of quality at a time  
                            - Differentiate learning opportunities to meet varying student needs | - Set measurable, attainable goals  
                            - Respond to feedback  
                            - Use mistakes as learning opportunities  
                            - Expect to make multiple attempts and don’t give up  
                            - Embrace a variety of learning opportunities |
Understanding by Design

How can unit design create opportunities for the kind of meaningful feedback that will help students gain proficiency?

Stages of “Traditional” Design
Planning and Implementation

1. Design Relevant Instruction
   - Learning experiences and formative feedback

2. Determine Acceptable Evidence
   - How students will demonstrate learning

3. Define Desired Results
   - What students will know and be able to do
Stages of Backward Design

Planning

Define Desired Results
- What students will know and be able to do

Determine Acceptable Evidence
- How students will demonstrate learning

Design Relevant Instruction
- learning experiences and formative feedback
Stages of Backward Design

Define Desired Results
- What students will know and be able to do

Determine Acceptable Evidence
- How students will demonstrate learning

Design Relevant Instruction
- learning experiences and formative feedback ties to learning targets

Planning

Implementation

Reflection
Unit Design Template

STAGE 1: Desired Results

STAGE 2: Evidence of Student Learning

STAGE 3: Instructional Design

Guiding Principles
21st Century Skills

Graduation Standards

Performance Indicators

Learning Targets
What makes formative assessment powerful?
At Your Tables

What do opportunities for feedback, reteaching, and re-assessment currently look like in your school or classroom?
“Providing specific feedback that helps students know how to improve their performance requires teachers to identify and understand the learning objectives (Stiggins, 2001). If teachers do not understand the learning objectives, it is difficult for them to provide students with information about what good performance or high-quality work looks like…. (Shirbagi, 2007; Shute, 2008).”

Formative Assessment

Learning Target -> Student Response

Adjust/ Modify Instruction if Necessary

Teacher, Peer and/or Self Interpretation or Diagnosis
Sarah Hagan’s classroom, Drumright, Oklahoma
### Options for Formative Assessment

#### Susan Brookhart: Tools for Formative Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tools for Formative Assessment</th>
<th>Techniques to Check for Understanding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Index Card Summaries/Questions</strong></td>
<td>Periodically, distribute index cards and ask students to write on both sides, with these instructions: (Side 1) based on our study of (unit topic), list a big idea that you understand and word it as a summary statement. (Side 2) Identify something about (unit topic) that you do not yet fully understand and word it as a statement or question.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hand Signals</strong></td>
<td>Ask students to display a designated hand signal to indicate their understanding of a specific concept, principal, or process: - I understand_________ and can explain it (e.g., thumbs up). – I do not yet understand_________ (e.g., thumbs down). – I’m not completely sure about_________ (e.g., wave hand).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>One Minute Essay</strong></td>
<td>A one-minute essay question (or one-minute question) is a focused question with a specific goal that can, in fact, be answered within a minute or two.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Analogy Prompt</strong></td>
<td>Periodically, present students with an analogy prompt: (A designated concept, principle, or process) is like_________ because_________.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Web or Concept Map</strong></td>
<td>Any of several forms of graphical organizers which allow learners to perceive relationships between concepts through diagramming key words representing those concepts. <a href="http://www.graphic.org/concept.html">http://www.graphic.org/concept.html</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Misconception Check</strong></td>
<td>Present students with common or predictable misconceptions about a designated concept, principle, or process. Ask them whether they agree or disagree and explain why. The misconception check can also be presented in the form of a multiple-choice or true-false quiz.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student Conference</strong></td>
<td>One on one conversation with students to check their level of understanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3-Minute Pause</strong></td>
<td>The Three-Minute Pause provides a chance for students to stop, reflect on the concepts and ideas that have just been introduced, make connections to prior knowledge or experience, and seek clarification. - I changed my attitude about... - I became more aware of... - I was surprised about... - I felt... - I related to...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It’s not formative assessment if it doesn’t inform instruction!
“When the cook tastes the soup, that’s formative assessment. When the customer tastes the soup, that’s summative assessment.”

—Paul Black
"The more teachers seek feedback about their impact, the more benefits accrue to their students."

Turn and Talk

What evidence do you see of the teacher’s thought process related to Assessment & Instruction Roles?
One Teacher’s Journey

Josh Tripp, Principal, Bucksport Middle School

Focus Question:

Which elements of the Assessment & Instruction Roles are evident in Josh’s journey?
In The Classroom: Before PBL

![Bar chart showing class time (minutes) before PBL.]

- Review HW: 10 minutes
- Present New Material: 25 minutes
- Practice: 5 minutes
In The Classroom: Before PBL

Quiz/Test
In The Classroom: After PBL

![Bar chart showing class time after PBL.]

- Check-In: 5 minutes
- Work / Formative Assessment: 35 minutes
Standard Operating Procedures

- Ask a Peer
- Check Your Notes
- Help Board
- Work on Another Problem
In The Classroom: After PBL

Mon

Tues

Wed

Thurs

Fri
One Teacher’s Journey
Josh Tripp, Principal, Bucksport Middle School

Turn and Talk

Which elements of the Assessment & Instruction Roles are evident in Josh’s journey?
Formative Assessment

“….a sequence of moves that invite a positive, ongoing relationship between teachers and their students.”

—Brent Dukor, “Formative Assessment in Seven Good Moves.” Educational Leadership, 71:6, March 2014
## Design Guide for Formative Assessment

### Proficiency-Based Learning: A Systemic Approach

#### Design Guide for Formative Assessment Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System Design</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Weaker Systems</th>
<th>Stronger Systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|               | Are standards and scoring criteria clear to students and teachers?     | System of standards is not clearly framed and articulated for both teachers and students.  
Teachers must independently determine standards and define the quality of work necessary to demonstrate proficiency.  
Students are unclear about how to use standards and scoring criteria to manage their own learning. | Standards and scoring criteria are clearly articulated and accessible to all.  
Teachers share common practices of how to utilize standards and scoring criteria for assessment and instruction.  
Students demonstrate understanding of what is expected in their learning and the work they produce. |
|               | Is the practice of collecting, analyzing and responding to formative assessment data systematic and embedded in the planning of instruction and daily lessons? | Use of formative assessment data is inconsistent, with a wide spectrum of practice from classroom to classroom.  
Expectations regarding the use of data are unclear or unstated.  
Teachers respond to data without coaching, structures, or collaboration. | Structures support routine collection, use and responsiveness to data by all teachers. (Ex: teaching teams, common planning time, department meetings, etc.)  
Teachers respond to data quickly (immediately or in subsequent lessons) to make adjustments to student learning experiences.  
Planning documents, data management systems, and professional development time specifically account for the collection of and response to formative and summative data. |
# Design Guide for Formative Assessment

**Proficiency-Based Learning:**

A Systemic Approach

## Design Guide for Formative Assessment Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Weaker Systems</th>
<th>Stronger Systems</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessment Design</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are the formative assessments aligned with the performance indicators?</td>
<td>Learning targets developed from the Performance Indicators are not formatively assessed. Assessments are based on activities instead of on learning targets.</td>
<td>Performance Indicators are unpacked into learning targets. All learning targets are formatively assessed throughout instruction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Will the formative assessment provide precise information about what students do and don’t understand?</td>
<td>All assessments focus on the lower levels of the thinking taxonomy. Assessments yield data but little insight into gaps in understanding or knowledge.</td>
<td>Formative assessments elicit information beyond a correct answer. Assessments reveal student understandings and misconceptions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is clear feedback provided to students and do they have opportunities to act upon that feedback?</td>
<td>Students only receive feedback when they receive a grade or final evaluation. Feedback is used to justify a grade or score.</td>
<td>Students know how to use feedback to improve performance. Students receive actionable feedback directly aligned to the learning targets and use it to improve performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instructional Design</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are the instructional activities aligned to the learning targets?</td>
<td>Instructional activities are not carefully aligned to learning targets.</td>
<td>Instructional activities support student understanding of learning targets, where they are in relation to the targets and how they can make progress toward targets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do teachers quickly adjust instruction based on formative data?</td>
<td>Teachers collect data but do not use it to adjust student learning experiences.</td>
<td>Teachers adjust their instructional plans in response to the results of formative assessments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do students use formative assessment data to self-assess and set goals?</td>
<td>Data is collected and used only by teachers. Students may self-assess or set goals, but those are not incorporated into learning experiences.</td>
<td>Students use feedback data to reflect on their progress and set goals. Students use feedback to adjust their performance throughout the instructional process.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Structuring Learning Experiences

The Workshop Model

- Warm up (5 min)
- Mini-Lesson (10-15 min)
- Independent Work (20-40 min)
- Share/Reflection (5 min)
# Structuring Learning Experiences

## Flipped Classroom

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRADITIONAL</th>
<th>FLIPPED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homework activities</td>
<td>Classroom activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Structuring Learning Experiences

Guided Reading with Jenna: Overview
Grade 5 / ELA / Differentiation
CCSS: ELA.RF.5.4a ELA.RL.5.10
Structuring Learning Experiences

Turn and Talk

• What lesson planning or classroom structures do you (or your school system) use?

• How do they enable you to answer…
  • Where am I going?
  • Where am I now?
  • How do I close the gap?
Differentiation

Getting Started on Differentiated Instructions
Differentiation is a teacher’s proactive response to learner needs, shaped by mindset, and guided by principles:

- An environment that encourages and supports learning
- Quality curriculum
- Assessment that informs teaching and learning
- Instruction that responds to student variance
- Leading students and managing routines

Tomlinson, Carol Ann and Tonya R. Moon (2010). *Assessment and Student Success in Differentiated Classrooms*. ASCD: Alexandria, VA
Differentiation

Teachers can differentiate through:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Affect/Environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The information and ideas students grapple with to reach learning goals</td>
<td>How students take in and make sense of the content</td>
<td>How students show what they know, understand and can do</td>
<td>The climate or tone of the classroom</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

according to students’

- Readiness
- Interests
- Learning Profile

Tomlinson, Carol Ann and Tonya R. Moon (2010). *Assessment and Student Success in Differentiated Classrooms.* ASCD: Alexandria, VA
Time for Re-Teaching, Revising + Re-Learning

- Enrichment Block
- Callback Block
- "Period 9"
- Mud Season School
- Learning Lab
- Marzano: Plan 70% of the year
- Genius Hour
- Student- or Teacher-Led Centers
- Daily Intervention Blocks
- Advisory
- Reteaching time embedded in class design
Final Reflection & Next Steps

- Where am I going?
- Where am I now?
- How do I close the gap?
Questions?
THANK YOU

Reed Dyer
Senior Associate
rdyer@greatschoolspartnership.org

Katie Thompson
Senior Associate
kthompson@greatschoolspartnership.org